MATH 2028 Honours Advanced Calculus II 2024-25 Term 1 Suggested Solution to Problem Set 3

Notations: Throughout this problem set, we use R to denote a rectangle in \mathbb{R}^n . When we write $R = A \times B$, then we mean $A \subset \mathbb{R}^m$ and $B \subset \mathbb{R}^k$ are rectangles with n = m + k.

Problems to hand in

1. Prove that if $A \subset \mathbb{R}^n$ is compact and has measure zero , then A has content zero .

Solution. $\forall \varepsilon > 0$, there exist a sequence of open rectangles R_1, R_2, \cdots , such that

$$A \subset \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} R_n$$

and

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} Vol(R_n) < \varepsilon.$$

then because A is compact , we can find finite many of such R_n such that

$$A \subset \bigcup_{n=1}^{m} R'_n$$

an at the same time $\sum Vol(R'_n) < \varepsilon$ then A is content zero .

- 2. Define the volume of a subset $\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^n$ by $Vol(\Omega) = \int_\Omega 1 dV$.
 - (a) Let $A \subset \mathbb{R}^n$ be a content zero subset. Prove that A must be bounded. Moreover, show that ∂A has measure zero and $\operatorname{Vol}(A) = 0$.
 - (b) Let $B \subset \mathbb{R}^n$ be a bounded subset of measure zero. Suppose ∂B has measure zero. Prove that $\operatorname{Vol}(B) = 0$.
 - **Solution.** (a) A is bounded because it can be covered by a finite collection of closed bounded rectangles.

 \overline{A} has content zero since \overline{A} is the smallest closed set containing A and a finite union of closed sets is closed. So $\partial A \subset \overline{A}$ has content zero, hence measure zero.

A finite collection of rectangles $\{R_i\}_{i=1}^k$ covering A will induce a partition \mathcal{P} of a rectangle $R \supset A$ such that $U(\chi_A, \mathcal{P}) \leq \sum_{i=1}^k \operatorname{Vol}(R_i)$, which can be made arbitrarily small.

(b) As B
= B ∪ ∂B, B
also has measure zero. B
is closed and bounded (since B is bounded), hence compact. So, by suggested exercise 3(c), B
has content zero, and so does B. So Vol(B) = 0 by (a).

3. Evaluate the following integrals:

(a)
$$\int_{R} \frac{x}{x^2 + y} \, dV$$
 where $R = [0, 1] \times [1, 3]$

(b) $\int_0^1 \int_{x^2}^x \frac{x}{1+y^2} dy dx$ (c) $\int_0^1 \int_{\sqrt{y}}^1 e^{y/x} dx dy$

Solution. (a) consider $[(x^2+3)\ln(x^2+3)]' = 2x\ln(x^2+3) + 2x$

$$\int_{R} \frac{x}{x^{2} + y} \, dV = \int_{0}^{1} \int_{1}^{3} \frac{x}{x^{2} + y} \, dy dx = \int_{0}^{1} x(\ln(x^{2} + 3) - \ln(x^{2} + 1)) dx$$
$$= \frac{1}{2}(1^{2} + 3)(\ln 1^{2} + 3) - \frac{1}{2}(0^{2} + 3)\ln(0^{2} + 3) - \frac{1}{2}(1^{2} + 1)\ln(1^{2} + 1) + \frac{1}{2}(0^{2} + 1)\ln(0^{2} + 1)$$
$$= \frac{1}{2}(6\ln 2 - 3\ln 3).$$

(b)

$$\begin{split} \int_0^1 \int_{x^2}^x \frac{x}{1+y^2} \, dy dx &= \int_0^1 \int_y^{\sqrt{y}} \frac{x}{1+y^2} \, dx dy = \int_0^1 \frac{y-y^2}{1+y^2} dy = \int_0^1 \frac{1}{2+2y^2} d(y^2) - \int_0^1 (1-\frac{1}{1+y^2}) dy \\ &= \frac{1}{2} (\frac{1}{2} \ln 2 - 1 + \frac{\pi}{4}). \end{split}$$

(c)

$$\int_0^1 \int_{\sqrt{y}}^1 e^{y/x} \, dx \, dy = \int_0^1 \int_0^{x^2} e^{y/x} \, dy \, dx = \int_0^1 x (e^x - e^0) \, dx = -\frac{1}{2} + [(x-1)e^x]_{x=1} - [(x-1)e^x]_{x=0} = \frac{1}{2}.$$

4. Let $\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^3$ be the portion of the cube $[0,1] \times [0,1] \times [0,1]$ lying above the plane y + z = 1 and below the plane x + y + z = 2. Evaluate the integral $\int_{\Omega} x \, dV$.

Solution.

$$\int_{\Omega} x \, dV = \int_{0}^{1} \int_{0}^{1} \int_{1-y}^{2-x-y} x \, dz \, dy \, dx - \int_{0}^{1} \int_{0}^{1-x} \int_{1}^{2-y-x} x \, dz \, dy \, dx$$
$$= \int_{0}^{1} \int_{0}^{1} x (1-x) \, dy \, dx + \int_{0}^{1} \int_{0}^{1-x} x (1-y-x) \, dy \, dx = \frac{1}{6} - \frac{1}{24} = \frac{1}{8}.$$

5. Let $f:R=[0,1]\times [0,1]\to \mathbb{R}$ be the function defined by

$$f(x,y) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } y \in \mathbb{Q}, \\ 2x & \text{if } y \notin \mathbb{Q}. \end{cases}$$

- (a) Prove that f is NOT integrable on R.
- (b) Show that each iterated integral $\int_0^1 \int_0^1 f(x, y) \, dx \, dy$ and $\int_0^1 \overline{f}_0^1 f(x, y) \, dy \, dx$ exist and compute their values.

Solution. (a) We want to show that f violates the integrability condition in challenging exercise 1 of Problem Set 1.

Let $\mathcal{P}_n := \{C_{i,j}^n := [\frac{i-1}{n}, \frac{i}{n}] \times [\frac{j-1}{n}, \frac{j}{n}] : 1 \leq i, j \leq n\}$ be a partition of R. Clearly, $\max_{i,j} \operatorname{diam}(C_{i,j}^n) \to 0$ as $n \to \infty$. However, note that

$$U(f, \mathcal{P}_{2n}) = \frac{1}{2} + \sum_{j=1}^{2n} \sum_{i=n+1}^{2n} 2 \cdot \frac{i}{2n} (\frac{1}{2n})^2$$
$$= \frac{1}{2} + 2(2n) \frac{(n+1+2n)n}{2} (\frac{1}{2n})^3$$
$$= \frac{1}{2} + \frac{3n+1}{4n},$$

and

$$L(f, \mathcal{P}_{2n}) = \sum_{j=1}^{2n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} 2 \cdot \frac{i-1}{2n} (\frac{1}{2n})^2 + \frac{1}{2}$$
$$= 2(2n) \frac{(n-1)n}{2} (\frac{1}{2n})^3 + \frac{1}{2}$$
$$= \frac{n-1}{4n} + \frac{1}{2}.$$

Now, f is not integrable on R because

$$U(f, \mathcal{P}_{2n}) - L(f, \mathcal{P}_{2n}) \rightarrow \frac{1}{2} \neq 0.$$

(b) If $y \in \mathbb{Q}$, then $f(\cdot, y) = 1$ is integrable on [0, 1] and

$$\int_0^1 f(x,y) \, dx = \int_0^1 1 \, dx = 1.$$

If $y \notin \mathbb{Q}$, then $f(\cdot, y) = 2x$ is integrable on [0, 1] and

$$\int_0^1 f(x,y) \, dx = \int_0^1 2x \, dx = 1.$$

Hence $y \mapsto \int_0^1 f(x,y) \ dx = 1$ is integrable on [0,1] and

$$\int_0^1 \int_0^1 f(x,y) \, dx dy = \int_0^1 1 \, dy = 1.$$

By the density of \mathbb{Q} and $\mathbb{R} \setminus \mathbb{Q}$, it is easy to see that

$$\overline{\int}_{0}^{1} f(x,y) \, dy = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } 0 \le x < \frac{1}{2} \\ 2x & \text{if } \frac{1}{2} \le x \le 1, \end{cases}$$

which is integrable over [0,1]. Hence $\int_0^1 \overline{\int}_0^1 f(x,y) \, dy dx$ exists and

$$\int_0^1 \overline{\int}_0^1 f(x,y) \, dy dx = \int_0^{\frac{1}{2}} \, dx + \int_{\frac{1}{2}}^1 2x \, dx = \frac{5}{4}.$$

г	

Suggested Exercises

- 1. (a) Show that the subset $\mathbb{R}^{n-1} \times \{0\} \subset \mathbb{R}^n$ has measure zero.
 - (b) Show that $\mathbb{Q}^c \cap [0,1]$ does not have measure zero in \mathbb{R} .

Solution. (a) The set can be covered by the union of rectangles

$$R_{i} = [-2^{i}, 2^{i}] \times \dots \times [-2^{i}, 2^{i}] \times [-\varepsilon/2^{(i+1)n}, \varepsilon/2^{(i+1)n}], \quad i \in \mathbb{N}$$
volume is $\sum_{i=1}^{\infty} V_{0}(R_{i}) = \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} (2 - 2^{i})^{n-1} = 2\varepsilon$

whose total volume is $\sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \operatorname{Vol}(R_i) = \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} (2 \cdot 2^i)^{n-1} \cdot \frac{2\varepsilon}{2^{(i+1)n}} = \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \frac{\varepsilon}{2^i} = \varepsilon.$ (b) If $\mathbb{Q}^c \cap [0,1]$ has measure zero, then $[0,1] = (\mathbb{Q} \cap [0,1]) \cup (\mathbb{Q}^c \cap [0,1])$ also has measure zero

as $\mathbb{Q} \cap [0,1]$ has measure zero, hence volume zero, which is not true.

2. Let $f: \Omega \to \mathbb{R}$ be a bounded continuous function defined on a bounded subset $\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^n$ whose boundary $\partial \Omega$ has measure zero. Suppose Ω is path-connected, i.e. for any $p, q \in \Omega$, there exists a continuous path $\gamma(t): [0,1] \to \Omega$ such that $\gamma(0) = p$ and $\gamma(1) = q$. Prove that there exists some $x_0 \in \Omega$ such that

$$\int_{\Omega} f \, dV = f(x_0) \operatorname{Vol}(\Omega).$$

Solution. Without loss of generality, we assume that f is non-constant and $Vol(\Omega) \neq 0$. Then there exists $u \in \Omega$ such that

$$m \coloneqq \inf_{x \in \Omega} f(x) < f(u) < \inf_{x \in \Omega} f(x) \eqqcolon M.$$

.

Let $\varepsilon > 0$ be very small. By continuity, there is $\delta > 0$ such that

$$m + \varepsilon < f(x) < M - \varepsilon \quad \text{for all } x \in B_{\delta}(u) \cap \Omega.$$

By considering $\int_{\Omega} f \, dV = \int_{\Omega \setminus B_{\delta}(u)} f \, dV + \int_{B_{\delta}(u)} f \, dV$, we have
 $m \operatorname{Vol}(\Omega \setminus B_{\delta}(u)) + (m + \varepsilon) \operatorname{Vol}(B_{\delta}(u)) \le \int_{\Omega} f \, dV \le M \operatorname{Vol}(\Omega \setminus B_{\delta}(u)) + (M - \varepsilon) \operatorname{Vol}(B_{\delta}(u))$
 $m \operatorname{Vol}(\Omega) + \varepsilon \operatorname{Vol}(B_{\delta}(u)) \le \int_{\Omega} f \, dV \le M \operatorname{Vol}(\Omega) - \varepsilon \operatorname{Vol}(B_{\delta}(u)),$

and thus

$$m + K\varepsilon \le \frac{1}{\operatorname{Vol}(\Omega)} \int_{\Omega} f \, dV \le M - K\varepsilon$$

where $K = \frac{\operatorname{Vol}(B_{\delta}(u))}{\operatorname{Vol}(\Omega)} > 0.$

By the definition of supremum and infimum, there exist $p_1, p_2 \in \Omega$ such that $f(p) > M - K\varepsilon$ and $f(q) < m + K\varepsilon$. Therefore,

$$f(q) < \frac{1}{\operatorname{Vol}(\Omega)} \int_{\Omega} f \, dV < f(p).$$

We want to apply the intermediate value theorem in 1-dimensional case. Since Ω is pathconnected, there is a continuous path $\gamma: [0,1] \to \Omega$ such that $\gamma(0) = p$ and $\gamma(1) = q$. Now $f \circ \gamma : [0,1] \to \mathbb{R}$ is a continuous function with $(f \circ \gamma)(0) = f(p)$ and $(f \circ \gamma)(1) = f(q)$. By intermediate value theorem, there exists $t_0 \in [0,1]$ such that $(f \circ \gamma)(t_0) = \frac{1}{\operatorname{Vol}(\Omega)} \int_{\Omega} f \, dV$. Finally, $x_0 \coloneqq \gamma(t_0) \in \Omega$ satisfies the desired property. 3. Find the volume of the region in \mathbb{R}^3 bounded by the cylinders $x^2 + y^2 = 1$ and $x^2 + z^2 = 1$. Solution. Consider the part $x, y, z \ge 0$, when x = h, we have $y^2, z^2 \le 1 - h^2$, ¹ so

Volume of the region =
$$\int_{-1}^{1} \int_{-\sqrt{1-x^2}}^{\sqrt{1-x^2}} \int_{-\sqrt{1-x^2}}^{\sqrt{1-x^2}} 1 \, dy \, dz \, dx = 4 \int_{-1}^{1} (1-x^2) \, dx = \frac{16}{3}.$$

4. Find the volume of the region in \mathbb{R}^3 bounded below by the *xy*-plane, above by z = y, and on the sides by $y = 4 - x^2$.

Solution. Let f(x, y) = y, $\Omega = \{(x, y) : 0 \le y \le 4 - x^2\}$. Then

Volume of the region
$$= \int_{\Omega} f \, dV$$
$$= \int_{-2}^{2} \int_{0}^{4-x^{2}} y \, dy dx$$
$$= \int_{-2}^{2} \frac{1}{2} (4-x^{2})^{2} \, dx$$
$$= \frac{256}{15}.$$

5. Let $f: \Omega \to \mathbb{R}$ be a C^2 function ² on an open subset $\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^2$. Use Fubini's Theorem to prove that $\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x \partial y} = \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial y \partial x}$ everywhere in Ω .

Solution. Applying Fubini's Theorem and the fundamental theorem of calculus, one can show that

$$\int_{R'} \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x \partial y} \, dV = \int_{R'} \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial y \partial x} \, dV,$$

and hence

$$\int_{R'} \left(\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x \partial y} - \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial y \partial x} \right) \, dV = 0,$$

for any subretcangle $R' \subset \Omega$. The continuity of $\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x \partial y} - \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial y \partial x}$ then implies that $\frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x \partial y} - \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial y \partial x} = 0$ on Ω .

6. Let $f: R = [a, b] \times [c, d] \to \mathbb{R}$ be a continuous function. Define another function $F: R \to \mathbb{R}$ such that

$$F(x,y) := \int_{[a,x] \times [c,y]} f \, dV.$$

Compute $\frac{\partial F}{\partial x}$ and $\frac{\partial F}{\partial y}$ in the interior of R.

 $^1\mathrm{Know}$ more interesting story about this , you can google Steinmetz solid .

²Recall that a function f is C^k if all the partial derivatives up to order k exist and are continuous.

Solution. By Fubini's Theorem and the fundamental theorem of calculus,

$$\frac{\partial F}{\partial x}(x,y) = \frac{\partial}{\partial x} \int_{a}^{x} \left(\int_{c}^{y} f \, dy \right) dx = \int_{c}^{y} f(x,y) \, dy,$$
$$\frac{\partial F}{\partial y}(x,y) = \frac{\partial}{\partial x} \int_{c}^{y} \left(\int_{a}^{x} f \, dx \right) dy = \int_{a}^{x} f(x,y) \, dx.$$

7. Let $f : R = [a, b] \times [c, d] \to \mathbb{R}$ be a continuous function such that $\frac{\partial f}{\partial y}$ is continuous on R. Define $G : [c, d] \to \mathbb{R}$ such that

$$G(y) := \int_{a}^{b} f(x, y) \, dx.$$

- (a) Show that G is continuous on [c, d].
- (b) Prove that G is differentiable on (c,d) and $G'(y) = \int_a^b \frac{\partial f}{\partial y}(x,y) dx$.

Solution. (a) For $y, y_0 \in [c, d]$,

$$|G(y) - G(y_0)| = \left| \int_a^b f(x, y) \, dx - \int_a^b f(x, y_0) \, dx \right|$$
$$= \left| \int_a^b (f(x, y) - f(x, y_0)) \, dx \right|$$
$$\leq \int_a^b |f(x, y) - f(x, y_0)| \, dx.$$

Let $\varepsilon > 0$. Since f is continuous on the compact set R, it is uniformly continuous on R. Then there exists $\delta > 0$ such that

$$|f(x,y) - f(u,v)| < \frac{\varepsilon}{b-a}$$
 whenever $||(x,y) - (u,v)|| < \delta$.

Now, if $|y - y_0| < \delta$, then $||(x, y) - (x, y_0)|| < \delta$, so that

$$|G(y) - G(y_0)| \le \int_a^b \frac{\varepsilon}{b-a} \, dx = \varepsilon.$$

Therefore G is uniformly continuous, hence continuous on [c, d].

(b) For $y \in (c, d)$ and h small,

$$\left|\frac{G(y+h) - G(y)}{h} - \int_{a}^{b} \frac{\partial f}{\partial y}(x,y) \, dx\right| \le \int_{a}^{b} \left|\frac{f(x,y+h) - f(x,y)}{h} - \frac{\partial f}{\partial y}(x,y)\right| \, dx.$$

By Mean Value Theorem, there exists ξ between y and y + h such that

$$\frac{f(x,y+h) - f(x,y)}{h} = \frac{\partial f}{\partial y}(x,\xi)$$

Let $\varepsilon > 0$. From the uniform continuity of $\frac{\partial f}{\partial y}$ on R, there exists $\delta > 0$ such that

$$\left|\frac{\partial f}{\partial y}(x,y) - \frac{\partial f}{\partial y}(u,v)\right| < \frac{\varepsilon}{b-a} \quad \text{whenever } \|(x,y) - (u,v)\| < \delta.$$

Now, if $0 < |h| < \delta$, we have $||(x,\xi) - (x,y)|| \le |h| < \delta$, and so

$$\begin{aligned} \left| \frac{G(y+h) - G(y)}{h} - \int_{a}^{b} \frac{\partial f}{\partial y}(x, y) \, dx \right| &\leq \int_{a}^{b} \left| \frac{\partial f}{\partial y}(x, \xi) - \frac{\partial f}{\partial y}(x, y) \right| \, dx \\ &\leq \int_{a}^{b} \frac{\varepsilon}{b-a} \, dx = \varepsilon. \end{aligned}$$

Therefore, G is differentiable on (c, d) and $G'(y) = \int_a^b \frac{\partial f}{\partial y}(x, y) dx$.

Challenging Exercises

1. The following exercise establishes the theorem that a bounded function $f : R \to \mathbb{R}$ is integrable if and only if f is continuous on R except on a set of measure zero. Let $f : R \to \mathbb{R}$ be a bounded function. For each $p \in R$ and $\delta > 0$, we define the *oscillation of* f *at* p as

$$o(f,p) = \lim_{\delta \to 0^+} \left(\sup_{x \in B_{\delta}(p) \cap R} f(x) - \inf_{x \in B_{\delta}(p) \cap R} f(x) \right).$$

- (a) Show that o(f, p) is well-defined and non-negative. Prove that f is continuous at p if and only if o(f, p) = 0.
- (b) For any $\epsilon > 0$, let $D_{\epsilon} := \{p \in R : o(f, p) \ge \epsilon\}$. Show that D_{ϵ} is a closed subset and the set of discontinuities D of f is given as $D = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} D_{1/n}$.
- (c) Suppose f is integrable on R. Prove that $D_{1/n}$ has content zero for any $n \in \mathbb{N}$. Hence, show that D has measure zero.
- (d) Suppose D has measure zero, prove that f is integrable on R.

Solution. (a) o(f, p) is well-defined and non-negative because $o(f, p, \delta) := \sup_{x \in B_{\delta}(p) \cap R} f(x) - \inf_{x \in B_{\delta}(p) \cap R} f(x) \ge 0$ decreases as $\delta \to 0^+$.

Suppose f is continuous at p. Let $\varepsilon > 0$. Then there exists $\delta > 0$ such that $|f(x) - f(p)| < \varepsilon/2$ whenever $x \in B_{\delta}(p)$. Thus $|f(x) - f(y)| < \varepsilon$ whenever $x, y \in B_{\delta}(p)$, so that $o(f, p) \leq \sup_{x \in B_{\delta}(p) \cap R} f(x) - \inf_{x \in B_{\delta}(p) \cap R} f(x) \leq \varepsilon$. Therefore, o(f, p) = 0.

The converse is clear since

$$|f(x) - f(y)| \le \sup_{x \in B_{\delta}(p) \cap R} f(x) - \inf_{x \in B_{\delta}(p) \cap R} f(x) \quad \text{for } x, y \in B_{\delta}(p).$$

(b) $R \setminus D_{\varepsilon}$ is open because

$$p \in R \setminus D_{\varepsilon} \implies \exists \delta > 0 \text{ s.t. } o(f, p, \delta) < \varepsilon$$
$$\implies \forall y \in B_{\delta/2}(p), o(f, y, \delta/2) \le o(f, p, \delta) < \varepsilon$$
$$\implies \forall y \in B_{\delta/2}(p), o(f, y) < \varepsilon$$
$$\implies B_{\delta/2}(p) \subset R \setminus D_{\varepsilon}.$$

By (a), $D = \{p \in R : o(f, p) > 0\} = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \{p \in R : o(f, p) \ge 1/n\} = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} D_{1/n}$.

(c) Let $\varepsilon, \eta > 0$. Choose a partition \mathcal{P} such that $U(f, \mathcal{P}) - L(f, \mathcal{P}) < \eta$. Then

$$\varepsilon \sum_{\substack{Q \in \mathcal{P} \\ Q \cap D_{\varepsilon} \neq \emptyset}} \operatorname{Vol}(Q) \le \sum_{\substack{Q \in \mathcal{P} \\ Q \cap D_{\varepsilon} \neq \emptyset}} [\sup_{x \in Q} f(x) - \inf_{y \in Q} f(y)] \operatorname{Vol}(Q) \le U(f, \mathcal{P}) - L(f, \mathcal{P}) < \eta$$

Since $\{Q \in \mathcal{P} : Q \cap D_{\varepsilon} \neq \emptyset\}$ covers $D_{\varepsilon}, D_{\varepsilon}$ has content zero, hence measure zero. So $D = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} D_{1/n}$ also has measure zero.

(d) Let $\varepsilon, \eta > 0$. D_{ε} has measure zero, hence content zero. So we can find a partition $\mathcal{P} = \{Q_i\}$ such that $\sum_{Q_i \cap D_{\varepsilon} \neq \emptyset} \operatorname{Vol}(Q_i) < \eta$. For any $x \in A \coloneqq \bigcup_{Q_i \cap D_{\varepsilon} = \emptyset} Q_i$, we have $o(f, x) < \varepsilon$ and thus there exists $\delta_x > 0$ such that $f(p) - f(q) < \varepsilon$ for $p, q \in B_{\delta_x}(x)$. By the compactness of A, $A \subset B_{\delta_{x_1}/2}(x_1) \cup \cdots \cup B_{\delta_{x_m}/2}(x_m)$. By refining \mathcal{P} if necessary, we have

$$\sup_{x \in Q_i} f(x) - \inf_{x \in Q_i} f(x) \le \varepsilon \quad \text{if } Q_i \cap D_{\varepsilon} = \emptyset.$$

Now $U(f, \mathcal{P}) - L(f, \mathcal{P}) \leq (\eta + \varepsilon) \operatorname{Vol}(R)$. Therefore f is integrable on R.