

eg 1 $f(x,y) = 3x^2 - 10xy + 3y^2 + 2x + 2y + 3$

Find and classify critical points of f .

Soln: (f polynomial, always C^2)

$$\vec{\nabla} f = [6x - 10y + 2 \quad -10x + 6y + 2]$$

$$Hf = \begin{bmatrix} 6 & -10 \\ -10 & 6 \end{bmatrix} \quad (\text{a constant matrix})$$

Critical point:

$$\vec{0} = \vec{\nabla} f \Leftrightarrow \begin{cases} 6x - 10y + 2 = 0 \\ -10x + 6y + 2 = 0 \end{cases}$$

$$\stackrel{\text{check}}{\iff} (x,y) = \left(\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}\right)$$

$$\det Hf = f_{xx}f_{yy} - f_{xy}^2 = 6 \cdot 6 - (-10)^2 = -64 < 0$$

$\Rightarrow \left(\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}\right)$ is a saddle point (by 2nd derivative test)

(No need to check $f_{xx} = 6 > 0$)

✘

eg 2: $f(x,y) = 3x - x^3 - 3xy^2$

Find and classify critical points of f

Solu (f polynomial, always C^2)

$$\vec{\nabla}f = [3 - 3x^2 - 3y^2, -6xy]$$

$$Hf = \begin{bmatrix} -6x & -6y \\ -6y & -6x \end{bmatrix}$$

Critical points =

$$\vec{0} = \vec{\nabla}f \Leftrightarrow \begin{cases} 3 - 3x^2 - 3y^2 = 0 \\ -6xy = 0 \end{cases}$$

check

$$\Leftrightarrow (x,y) = (0,1), (0,-1)$$

$$(1,0), (-1,0)$$

(4 critical points)

Critical point	Hf	$f_{xx}f_{yy} - f_{xy}^2$ = det Hf	f_{xx}	classification
(0,1)	$\begin{bmatrix} 0 & -6 \\ -6 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$	$-36 < 0$	No need	saddle
(0,-1)	$\begin{bmatrix} 0 & 6 \\ 6 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$	$-36 < 0$	No need	saddle
(1,0)	$\begin{bmatrix} -6 & 0 \\ 0 & -6 \end{bmatrix}$	$36 > 0$	$-6 < 0$	local max
(-1,0)	$\begin{bmatrix} 6 & 0 \\ 0 & 6 \end{bmatrix}$	$36 > 0$	$6 > 0$	local min

#

eg 3 (Inconclusive from 2nd derivative test)

$$f(x,y) = x^2 + y^4, \quad g(x,y) = x^2 - y^4, \quad h(x,y) = -x^2 - y^4$$

(at (0,0): local min, saddle, local max)

Sols

$$\vec{\nabla} f = [2x \ 4y^3] \quad \vec{\nabla} g = [2x \ -4y^3] \quad \vec{\nabla} h = [-2x \ -4y^3]$$

$$(\vec{\nabla} f(0,0) = [0, 0] = \vec{\nabla} g(0,0) = \vec{\nabla} h(0,0))$$

$$Hf = \begin{bmatrix} 2 & 0 \\ 0 & 12y^2 \end{bmatrix} \quad Hg = \begin{bmatrix} 2 & 0 \\ 0 & -12y^2 \end{bmatrix} \quad Hh = \begin{bmatrix} -2 & 0 \\ 0 & -12y^2 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$Hf(0,0) = \begin{bmatrix} 2 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} \quad Hg(0,0) = \begin{bmatrix} 2 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} \quad Hh(0,0) = \begin{bmatrix} -2 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\det Hf(0,0) = \det Hg(0,0) = \det Hh(0,0) = 0.$$

\therefore 2nd derivative test is inconclusive.

Higher dimension example

eg: $g(x,y,z) = xy + yz + zx$

has definite sign for $(x,y,z) \neq (0,0,0)$?

Answer: No

Solu: Trick: $g(x,y,z) = \frac{1}{4}(x+y)^2 - \frac{1}{4}(x-y)^2 + z(x+y)$

Let $u = \frac{x+y}{2}$, $v = \frac{x-y}{2}$, then

$$\begin{aligned}g &= u^2 - v^2 + 2uz \\&= (u^2 + 2uz + z^2) - v^2 - z^2 \\&= (u+z)^2 - v^2 - z^2 \\&= \frac{1}{4}(x+y+2z)^2 - \frac{1}{4}(x-y)^2 - z^2\end{aligned}$$

- On the plane $x+y+2z=0$ (i.e. $z = -\frac{x+y}{2}$)

$$\begin{aligned}g &= g(x, y, -\frac{x+y}{2}) = -\frac{1}{4}(x-y)^2 - \frac{1}{4}(x+y)^2 \\&< 0 \quad \text{for } (x, y, -\frac{x+y}{2}) \neq \vec{0}\end{aligned}$$

- Along the line $\begin{cases} x-y=0 \\ z=0 \end{cases} \Rightarrow \begin{cases} x=y \\ z=0 \end{cases}$

$$\begin{aligned}g &= g(x, x, 0) = \frac{1}{4}(x+x+0)^2 - 0^2 - 0^2 = x^2 > 0 \\&(\forall x \neq 0, \text{ i.e. } \forall (x, x, 0) \neq \vec{0})\end{aligned}$$

(Together $\Rightarrow (0,0,0)$ is a saddle point) ~~✗~~

Second Derivative Test for general n

Recall f is $C^2 \Rightarrow$ (by Clairaut's / mixed derivative Thm)

$$Hf(\vec{a}) = [f_{x_i x_j}]_{i,j=1,\dots,n} \text{ is symmetric}$$

Theory of Linear Algebra \Rightarrow Hf is diagonalizable

i.e. \exists orthogonal $n \times n$ matrix P (i.e. $P^T P = \text{Id}$) s.t.

$$P^T Hf(\vec{a}) P = \begin{bmatrix} \lambda_1 & & 0 \\ & \ddots & \\ 0 & & \lambda_n \end{bmatrix}$$

where $\lambda_i, i=1,\dots,n$, are eigenvalues of $Hf(\vec{a})$.

$$\Rightarrow Hf(\vec{a}) \text{ is } \begin{cases} \text{positive definite} \Leftrightarrow \text{all } \lambda_i > 0 \\ \text{negative definite} \Leftrightarrow \text{all } \lambda_i < 0 \\ \text{indefinite} \Leftrightarrow \text{some } \lambda_i > 0, \text{ some } \lambda_j < 0 \text{ (all } \neq 0) \end{cases}$$

Another way to check is consider determinants of submatrix

For each $1 \leq k \leq n$,
consider submatrix H_k given by
the upper left $k \times k$ entries.

$$\begin{bmatrix} f_{x_1 x_1} & \dots & f_{x_1 x_k} & \dots & f_{x_1 x_n} \\ \vdots & & \vdots & & \vdots \\ f_{x_k x_1} & \dots & f_{x_k x_k} & \dots & f_{x_k x_n} \\ \vdots & & \vdots & & \vdots \\ f_{x_n x_1} & \dots & f_{x_n x_k} & \dots & f_{x_n x_n} \end{bmatrix}$$

Then

$Hf(\vec{a})$ is positive definite $\Leftrightarrow \det H_k > 0, \forall k=1, \dots, n$

$Hf(\vec{a})$ is negative definite $\Leftrightarrow \det H_k \begin{cases} < 0, & k \text{ odd} \\ > 0, & k \text{ even} \end{cases}$

egs (1) $n=2$ $\begin{bmatrix} f_{xx} & f_{xy} \\ f_{yx} & f_{yy} \end{bmatrix}$ has $H_1 = [f_{xx}]$
 $H_2 = \begin{bmatrix} f_{xx} & f_{xy} \\ f_{yx} & f_{yy} \end{bmatrix}$

$\Rightarrow \det H_1 = f_{xx}$

$\det H_2 = f_{xx}f_{yy} - f_{xy}^2$

(Same result as before)

(2) Diagonal matrix $\begin{bmatrix} \lambda_1 & & & 0 \\ & \ddots & & \\ & & \lambda_k & \\ 0 & & & \ddots \\ & & & & \lambda_n \end{bmatrix} \Rightarrow H_k = \begin{bmatrix} \lambda_1 & & 0 \\ & \ddots & \\ 0 & & \lambda_k \end{bmatrix}$

$\Rightarrow \det H_k = \lambda_1 \cdots \lambda_k.$